# Table of Contents

Preface and acknowledgments

Glossary of terms

Latin terms

List of abbreviations

List of tables and figures

## Chapter 1: Introduction

1 The research in a nutshell

2 Setting the scene

  2.1 The conflict rules

  2.2 The conflict rules and mobility

  2.3 Highly mobile workers (HMWs)

  2.4 Issues of legal uncertainty

3 Research purpose

  3.1 Research aims

  3.2 Research questions

4 Methodology

  4.1 Research method

  4.2 Research scope

    4.2.1 Legal scope

    4.2.2 Personal scope

    4.2.3 Temporal scope

    4.2.4 Territorial scope

5 Relevance and added value

6 Research limitations

7 Structure of the book
Part I

Chapter 2: Highly mobile workers challenging Regulation 883/2004: Pushing borders or opening Pandora’s box? 41
  1 Introduction 41
    1.1 Setting the scene: A changing European labour market 41
    1.2 Approach 42
    1.3 Outline 44
  2 EU social security law 45
  3 Article 13: Working in various Member States 46
    3.1 When is a person pursuing activities in two or more Member States? 47
      3.1.1 Observing all activities 47
        3.1.1.1 What are marginal activities? 48
      3.1.2 Location of activities in two or more Member States 51
        3.1.2.1 ‘Normally’ working in two Member States 52
    3.2 How must Article 13 be applied? 57
      3.2.1 The classification of work 57
        3.2.1.1 The hierarchy between work classifications 58
        3.2.1.2 The substantial part of activities for (self-)employed persons 59
      3.2.2 The connecting factor 60
  4 Practical challenges for HMWs 63
  5 Closing remarks: Article 13, a marriage between strict requirements and legal ambiguities? 69
    5.1 Conclusion 69
    5.2 Reflections 71

Chapter 3: The judicial finetuning of the EU rules determining the applicable social security legislation 73
  1 Introduction 73
  2 The simultaneous pursuit of activities in two or more Member States 75
  3 Posting 78
    3.1 Article 12 79
      3.1.1 The ‘non-replacement condition’ 79
3.1.2 Temporary-work agencies and the condition of ‘normally’ carrying out activities in the Member State of establishment 81

3.2 Article 13 83
3.2.1 Normally working in two or more Member States 84
3.2.2 Employer 87

4 Abuse and Fraud 88

5 Employment and/or residence outside the EU 92
5.1 Employment outside the Union 92
5.2 Residence Outside the Union 94

6 Gaps in social security protection 95
6.1 Exclusivity and the power of a non-competitive Member State to grant benefits 96
6.2 Gaps in social security protection resulting from disparities in national legislation 99

7 Conclusion 101

Part II

Chapter 4: Possible routes towards legal certainty for highly mobile workers under current Regulation 883/2004 105
1 Introduction 105
1.1 Setting the scene 105
1.2 Approach 107
1.3 Outline 110

2 Increasing transparency and clarity in terms and rules ex ante 110
2.1 Introduction 110

2.2 Clarifying assessment criteria 110
2.2.1 Introduction 110
2.2.2 ‘Marginal activity’: Define or abolish 111
2.2.3 Define ‘substantial part of activities’ 118
2.2.4 An assessment framework for ‘normally’ working in two or more Member States 121

2.3 Informing proactively 125
2.3.1 Introduction 125
2.3.2 Information on work classification for social security purposes 126
2.3.3 Non-binding ex ante A1-certificate outlook 129
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4</td>
<td>Article 16-agreements</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Transcending the limits of the EU social security law</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Upgrading the underlying assumptions of pursuing activities across borders</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Including periods of inactivity into the concept of ‘normally’ working</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>Observing a longer period in time of work</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4</td>
<td>Expanding the possibilities of a legal fiction</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>A social security ‘crash barrier’ by the CJEU?</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 5: Possible routes towards legal certainty for highly mobile workers while thinking out-of-the-(pandoras)-box 163

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Setting the scene</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Outline</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Adapting the system of conflict rules of Regulation 883/2004</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Introduction: A special conflict rule for HMWs</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Lex domicilii for HMWs</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>The closest link principle</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Right of option for the applicable law</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Expanding the system of conflict rules of Regulation 883/2004</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Introduction: From unicity towards plurality</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Extending the Bosmann-principle: option for double affiliation</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Separating the benefits from the contributions</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Going beyond the existing framework</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Introduction: Expanding or supplementing Regulation 883/2004</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>A clause of mutual responsibility for disproportionate ‘gaps’ in social security protection</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>A (EU) hardship fund</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>A virtual Member State</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 6: Feasibility and implementation challenges on multiple action levels

1 Introduction 211  
1.1 Setting the scene 211  
1.2 Approach 211  
1.3 Outline 212  
2 A short sketch of social policy competences of the EU 212  
2.1 The TFEU and social security measures 213  
2.2 The legislative procedure of legislative acts in the area of social security 217  
2.3 Alternative: A flexible European integration approach 219  
2.4 Alternative: Soft law options 222  
3 Legal policy instruments and different levels of action 224  
3.1 Introduction 224  
3.2 Macro-level: Hard and soft law options on a supranational and national level 225  
3.2.1 EU hard law 225  
3.2.2 EU soft law 226  
3.2.3 National hard law 229  
3.3 Meso-level: Implementation rules 230  
3.4 Micro-level: The HWW and the employer engaging in cross-border activities 233  
4 Conclusion 234  
5 Annexes 236  
5.1 ANNEX I Overview of possible policy actions and EU social security law on various action levels 236  
5.2 ANNEX II Overview of proposed routes Chapters 4 and 5 towards more legal certainty for HMWs and possible policy implementations 241

## Chapter 7: Concluding remarks and policy recommendations 245  
1 Introduction 245  
2 Research outcome regarding legal uncertainty for HMWs 246  
2.1 Findings of PART I 246  
2.1.1 EU social security law and highly mobile workers 246  
2.1.2 Reflections I 248  
2.2 Findings of PART II 249
2.2.1 Towards more legal certainty and stability for highly mobile workers within the conflict rules 249
  2.2.1.1 Increase clarity and transparency 249
  2.2.1.2 Inform stakeholders proactively 250

2.2.2 Possible routes towards continuous social security protection for highly mobile workers in the light of EU law 250
  2.2.2.1 Introduce a conflict rule for HMWs 251
  2.2.2.2 A shift from unicity to plurality 251
  2.2.2.3 Counterbalance disproportionate negative effects 252
  2.2.2.4 Introduce a virtual Member State for HMWs 252

2.2.3 Reflections II 253

3 Closing Pandora’s box: Recommendation and considerations towards more legal certainty for HMWs 254
  3.1 The way forward 254
  3.2 Some resolution strategies 258
  3.2.1 Resolution strategies at the European level 258
    3.2.1.1 Two short-term strategies: Providing financial relief and incentives 259
    3.2.1.2 Two long-term strategies: Amending Regulation 883/2004 261
  3.2.2 A short-term resolution strategy at the national level 264
  3.3 Final remarks 265

Bibliography 269