

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations	xiii
1 Defining Comparative Constitutional Justice	1
1.1 Demarcating Constitutional Justice: Between Didactics and Research	1
1.2 Defining Constitutional Justice: From Form to Function	4
1.3 Comparative Constitutional Justice: Some Methodological Issues	6
1.4 Comparing Constitutional Justice: Taxonomies	8
1.5 From Dichotomic to Fuzzy Classifications: A Renovated Methodological Approach to Comparative Constitutional Justice	11
1.6 Devising a New Classification: <i>Review of Legislation v. Constitutional Review</i>	12
1.7 Taxonomies, Models and Typologies	14
1.8 Litigating Human Rights: Treaty-Based Judicial Review as a Form of Constitutional Review	16
1.9 Survey of the Volume	18
Part I Constitutional Review: The Legality of Norms	
2 Prototypes of Constitutional Litigation	23
2.1 History and Comparative Law: The Onset of the Judicial Review of Legislation	23
2.2 Historical Precedents: Ancient and Mediaeval Constitutionalism	25
2.3 Judicial Review of Legislation and Its Mediaeval English-Law Background	28
2.4 <i>Bonham's Case</i> : An Early Form of Judicial Review of Legislation	31
2.5 Judicial Review of Legislation and Its Migration to the American Colonies	34
2.6 From 'Concentrated' to 'Diffuse'. Birth and Evolution of the US System of Constitutional Review	37
2.7 Parliamentary Supremacy or Judicial Review of Legislation? The Constitutional Dilemma in Revolutionary France and Nineteenth Century Europe	40
2.8 The UK Case: Parliamentary Sovereignty at Home and Constitutional Review Overseas	44

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.9	Early Cases of Constitutional Review in Norway	46
2.10	Before Kelsen: Experimenting with Judicial Review in Latin America	48
2.11	Constitutionalism 'Fin de Siècle' and 'Entre Deux Guerres' Kelsen	51
2.12	Mimicking Kelsen: The Tribunal of Constitutional Guarantees and the 1931 Spanish Constitutionalism	53
3	Dissemination, Alteration and Deformation of Constitutional Justice	55
3.1	The Aftermath of World War II: From Nomocratic to Pantocratic Review	55
3.2	Incidental Access to Concentrated Adjudication: Italy and Germany as a Third Genus?	56
3.3	Revisiting the U.S. Exemplary Model: India and Japan	58
3.4	Austria and Switzerland	61
3.5	From Political to Judicial Review: France, 1958-2008	63
3.6	Political Review in Marxist Theory and Practice: Soviet Law	65
3.7	Chinese Constitutional Litigation?	68
3.8	Constitutional Reforms and Transplants in Latin America	69
3.9	Decolonizing Constitutional Justice. French Legacies in Maghreb and Lebanon	70
3.10	British Colonies and the JCPC Jurisdiction: The Global North ...	72
3.11	... And the Global South. Eurocentric Attitudes in Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa	74
3.12	The JCPC Jurisdiction: British Overseas Territories and Commonwealth Caribbean	76
3.13	Nordic Adjudication	78
3.14	Mixed Systems: Greece and Portugal	80
3.15	Concentrated Adjudication in the 1978 Spanish Constitution	82
3.16	Constitutional Review on Islamic Grounds: Iran	82
3.17	Concentrated Adjudication and Its Variants in the 1980s: Turkey and Belgium	84
3.18	New Constitutional Cycles in the 1990s	86
3.18.1	Judicial Review in Israel	86
3.18.2	Latin American Experiments: The Nuevo Constitucionalismo	87
3.18.3	Post-Socialist Patterns of Judicial Review	90
3.18.4	South Africa	91
3.19	The New Commonwealth Model of Constitutionalism as a Form of Reverse Colonisation	94

3.20	Exporting Democracy and Constitutional Review: Iraq, Afghanistan and Myanmar	96
3.21	Populism and Constitutional Justice in Eastern Europe: Hungary and Poland	98
4	Variables of Constitutional Justice	101
4.1	The Variables of Nomocratic Review	101
4.2	Access to Constitutional Litigation	101
4.2.1	Access Upon Direct Application	102
4.2.2	Challenging Legislation: Prior or After Its Entry into Force	103
4.2.3	Right to Standing or Right to Access?	104
4.2.4	Incidental Access	106
4.2.5	Common-Law Access to Constitutional Litigation	108
4.3	The Object of Review	110
4.4	Constitutional Yardsticks	112
4.5	Constitutional Jurisdictional Procedure	114
4.5.1	Composition of the Bench	115
4.5.2	Parties to the Proceedings and Third Parties	116
4.5.3	Evidentiary Rules in Constitutional Litigation	117
4.5.4	Deliberation and Decision-Making Processes	118
4.5.5	Interim Measures	119
4.6	Opinions: Interpretative ...	120
4.7	... and Manipulatory Judgements	123
4.8	Effects of Decisions in Constitutional Issues	125
4.9	Enforcement of Judgements	128
Part II Pantocratic Review and the Distribution of Sovereign Powers		
5	Judicial Review on Federal Grounds	135
5.1	Federalism, Quasi-Federalism and Judicial Review	135
5.2	Binary Classifications and Judicial Review on Federal Grounds	138
5.3	Prevention as a Form of Resolution of Federal Disputes	140
5.4	A Priori Federal Review: Pre-Enactment Scrutiny and Certification	143
5.5	Nomocratic Judicial Review	147
5.6	Settling Federal Disputes by Way of Arbitration	151

TABLE OF CONTENTS

6	Judicial Review and Sovereign Powers	153
6.1	From Ancillary Powers to Pantocratic Review	153
6.2	Electoral Disputes	154
6.3	Banning Political Parties	156
6.4	Legislative Initiative and Referenda	157
6.5	Constitutional Arbitration Related to Legal Pluralism	160
6.6	Constitutional Litigation Related to Local Government	162
6.7	Individual Constitutional Complaints in Human Rights Litigation: Origins	164
6.8	Trends of 'Centralisation' in Constitutional Complaint Jurisdictions	166
6.9	Trends of 'Diffusion' in <i>Amparo</i> Proceedings	169
6.10	Redress Clauses in Common Law	171
6.11	Challenging Constitutional Omissions	173
6.12	Litigating Emergency Proclamations	175
6.13	Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendments	177
7	Constitutional Adjudicators and Frame of Government	181
7.1	Pantocratic Review and State Institutions	181
7.2	Impeachment	182
7.3	Disputes between Organs of State and Scrutiny of Decision-Making Processes	185
7.4	Ex-Ante Scrutiny on International Treaties	187
7.5	Reference Jurisdiction	189
Part III Human Rights Protection and Democratic Difficulties		
8	Varieties of Judicial Review: Constitutional, Treaty-Based and Transnational	197
8.1	Supranational Judicial Review and Constitutional Justice	197
8.2	The Incorporation of International Law into Domestic Law	198
8.3	Treaty-Based Judicial Review as the 'Armed Branch' of Transnational Constitutionalism	201
8.3.1	The Inter-American System of Human Rights Protection and Domestic Judicial Review	203
8.3.2	The European System of Human Rights Protection and Domestic Judicial Review	208
8.3.3	National Judges and Direct Application of EU Law	210

8.4	Transnational, Treaty-Based Judicial Review: An Autonomous System of Human Rights Protection?	211
9	Almighty Judges? The Legitimacy of Constitutional Review	213
9.1	Introduction	213
9.2	Constitutional Justice and Democratically Consented Power	215
9.3	Tensions Between Courts and Legislatures	218
9.4	Giving Reasons: Dissenting Opinions in a Comparative Perspective	222
9.4.1	Foreign and Comparative-Law Arguments in Constitutional Adjudication	222
9.4.2	Dissenting Opinions: A Transparent Tool in Judicial Lawmaking	225
9.5	Constitutional Review and Deliberative Democracy	226