

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1	Introduction, approach and methodology	1
1.1	Introduction: an issue of (the) margins	1
1.1.1	TCEs, threats and trends	4
1.1.2	Transboundary legal protection questions on authorisation, preservation and human rights	5
1.1.3	Answering the research question with a three-way legal and foundational analysis	7
1.2	Challenges and protection interests	8
1.2.1	Indigenous peoples	8
1.2.2	Traditional cultural expressions	9
1.2.3	Protection interests	11
1.3	A systems perspective	12
1.3.1	Unauthorised use and exclusive rights	13
1.3.2	Preservation, maintenance and transmission	14
1.3.3	Heritage and human rights struggles	15
1.3.4	Beyond existing approaches	16
1.3.5	Mapping the legal diversity	17
1.4	Structure and methodology	19
1.4.1	An information law perspective	20
1.4.2	Issues of context and content	21
1.4.3	Three legal perspectives	23
1.5	Outcome and operationalisation	25
Chapter 2	Background, history and protection interests	27
2.1	Introduction: the context and content of the protection of TCEs	27
2.1.1	History	28
	Histories of dispossession and indigenous peoples	28
	Developments in international law and indigenous peoples	30
	The influence of history vis-à-vis TCE protection	35
2.1.2	Power and politics	37
2.1.3	Land claims and cultural expressions	41
2.1.4	Globalisation and technological developments	42
	Globalisation	43
	Technological developments	47
2.2	TCEs and indigenous peoples: a new chapter in the indigenous rights movement?	51

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.2.1	Copyright context	51
2.2.2	Cultural heritage context	56
2.2.3	Human rights context	61
2.3	Traditional cultural expressions explained	64
2.3.1	A closer look at traditional cultural expressions	64
	Holistic	65
	Impersonal, traditional and oral	66
	Secrecy and sacredness	68
2.3.2	Appropriation issues	69
	Cultural appropriation	69
	Cultural misappropriation and misrepresentation	71
	Commercialisation	75
2.4	Criticisms of TCE protection and countervailing interests	76
2.4.1	The public domain, commons and remix	77
2.4.2	Freedom of (artistic) expression	80
2.4.3	General: protection of TCEs and countervailing interests	83
	Copyright law	85
	Cultural heritage law	86
	Human rights law	88
	Customary laws	91
	Geographically determined competing interests	92
2.4.4	Conclusion	94
2.5	Protection arguments and interests	94
2.5.1	Categorisation of indigenous peoples' protection interests	95
2.5.2	Categorisation discourse: approaches in academic literature	98
2.5.3	Economic and development argument	100
	History and developments of the argument	100
	Examples of protection interests informed by the argument	101
2.5.4	Heritage argument	102
	History and developments of the argument	103
	Examples of protection interests informed by the argument	103
2.5.5	Human rights argument	106
	History and development of the argument	106
	Examples of protection interests informed by the argument	107
2.5.6	The hybrid argument	110
2.5.7	Concluding thoughts on categorisation and protection interests	112
2.6	Conclusion	113
Chapter 3	Copyright law and traditional cultural expressions	117
3.1	Introduction: copyright law and TCEs	117

3.1.1	Intellectual property law and TCEs	119
3.1.2	Categorisation of IP subject matter vis-à-vis indigenous heritage	121
3.1.3	A focus on copyright law	123
3.1.4	Indigenous rights and development as a contextual backdrop	125
3.1.5	Nature and subject of protection: diverging perceptions of ownership, property and ‘works’	128
3.2	Instruments and requirements of international copyright law	131
3.2.1	The BC and UCC: history and development	132
3.2.2	Coloured by complexity: copyright characteristics and requirements and TCEs	134
	Originality	136
	Fixation	138
	Authorship	139
	Transferability and ownership	143
	Duration	145
	In sum	146
3.2.3	The importance of protection, preservation and promotion	148
	Various understandings of protection	148
	Defensive protection and TCEs	149
	Risk of loss of TCEs: preservation	150
	Promotion of TCEs	152
3.3	Traditions, theories and rationales of copyright law	152
3.3.1	Utilitarian tradition and incentive theories	153
	Utilitarianism	154
	Incentives	156
3.3.2	Natural law tradition, labour, personality and <i>droit d’auteur</i> theories	157
	Natural rights and labour	158
	Personality and <i>droit d’auteur</i>	159
	Moral rights	161
3.3.3	Notions of fairness	162
	Distributive justice	163
	Misappropriation, misrepresentation and unjust enrichment	165
3.4	Protection interests and theories: a mixed bag	167
3.4.1	Utilitarianism and incentive theories	168
	Utilitarianism	168
	Incentives	169
3.4.2	Natural rights tradition and labour, personality and <i>droit d’auteur</i> theories	171
	Labour	172

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Personality and identity	173
	Moral rights	175
3.4.3	Notions of fairness	177
	Distributive justice	177
	Misappropriation and misrepresentation	179
	Unjust enrichment	180
3.4.4	Defensive protection	181
	TCEs and ‘cultural privacy’	183
3.5	Conclusion: from material difficulties to foundational opportunities	184
Chapter 4	Cultural heritage law and traditional cultural expressions	187
4.1	Introduction: cultural heritage law and TCEs	187
4.1.1	A focus on history, concepts and principles	188
4.1.2	Central aspects of cultural heritage and TCEs	189
	Heritage as a qualifier	189
	Preservation	190
	Relationship between communities and cultural heritage	191
	Power	193
	Land	194
	All mankind as beneficiary	195
4.1.3	Cultural heritage law: focus on preservation	198
4.1.4	Cultural heritage and human rights law	198
4.1.5	Cultural heritage law on a deeper level: objectives and rationales	200
4.2	Short introduction to instruments, theories and principles	201
4.2.1	Tangible cultural heritage in armed conflict	202
4.2.2	Movement of tangible cultural heritage	204
4.2.3	Intangible cultural heritage	205
4.2.4	Cultural heritage and cultural diversity	207
4.3	Cultural heritage protection: developments and instruments	208
4.3.1	Cultural heritage in armed conflict	210
	Early regulations	210
	Context and objectives of the 1954 The Hague Convention	212
	Cultural heritage: a general standard of understanding	214
	Measures: safeguarding and respect	214
	Other measures: use of an emblem and sanctions	215
	Main principles of the 1954 The Hague Convention and TCEs	216
4.3.2	Cultural heritage and illicit trade	216
	Preliminary developments: 1956 and 1964 Recommendations	217
	Context and objectives of the 1970 Convention	218
	Cultural heritage: categories of tangible cultural property	220

	Measures against illicit trade	221
	Main principles of the 1970 Convention and TCEs	222
4.3.3	Cultural heritage, restitution and return	222
	Context of the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention	223
	Objectives, scope and definitions	225
	Measures: restitution and return	226
	Main principles of the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention and TCEs	227
4.3.4	Cultural heritage as world heritage	228
	Context and objectives of the 1972 World Heritage Convention	228
	Definitions and scope	230
	Measures: national and international protection	231
	Other measures: the World Heritage List, awareness raising and education	232
	Main principles of the 1972 World Heritage Convention and TCEs	233
4.3.5	Towards protection of intangible cultural heritage	234
	Copyright and folklore: preliminary developments to the 2003 Convention	234
	A Recommendation on folklore as a first step	236
	Context, objectives and definitions of the 2003 ICH Convention	238
	Measures: national inventories, education and awareness raising	240
	Measures: safeguarding at the international level	242
	Main principles of the 2003 Intangible Cultural Heritage Convention and TCEs	243
4.3.6	Cultural heritage and cultural diversity	244
	Context and preliminary developments	245
	Objectives and definitions of the 2005 Cultural Diversity Convention	247
	Measures to protect and promote the diversity of cultural expressions	250
	Main principles of the 2005 Cultural Diversity Convention and TCEs	251
4.4	The shifts in cultural heritage law: protection theories and principles	252
4.4.1	Cultural heritage measures and TCEs	254
	Safeguarding and respect – Positive and negative measures	255
	Raising awareness I – Emblems, lists and designations	256
	Raising awareness II – Education, information and knowledge	257
4.4.2	Protection for the benefit of all mankind vis-à-vis source communities	258
	Benefit of all mankind	258

TABLE OF CONTENTS

4.4.3	Roles in identity construction, cultural contexts and living cultures	260
	Identity construction	260
	Cultural context and living culture	261
4.4.4	Preserving cultural diversity, inheritances, cultural contexts and living cultures	263
	Cultural diversity	263
	Transmission to future generations	265
	Cultural context and living culture	266
4.4.5	A cultural heritage law analysis of TCE protection	267
4.5	Conclusion: from static cultural heritage law to inclusiveness	268
Chapter 5	Human rights law and traditional cultural expressions	271
5.1	Introduction: human rights law and TCEs	271
5.1.1	The context of human rights and TCEs	272
5.1.2	Focus on cultural and indigenous rights	276
5.1.3	Human rights obligations and TCEs: respect, protect, fulfil	278
5.2	International human rights law, cultural rights and indigenous rights	281
5.2.1	International human rights law	281
5.2.2	Cultural rights	284
	What is culture?	285
	Culture as a qualifier of rights and narrow versus broad views	287
	Is there a right to culture and other criticisms of cultural rights	290
5.2.3	Indigenous rights	293
	Indigenous rights developments	293
	Definitions of ‘indigenous peoples’	297
	Indigenous rights and narrow versus broad views	300
	Criticisms of indigenous rights	301
5.2.4	The tension between group rights and individual rights	303
5.3	Cultural rights, indigenous rights and guiding principles	306
5.3.1	Short introduction to the international human rights system	307
5.3.2	Self-determination	311
	Self-determination as a framework right	312
	Self-determination, natural resources and cultural rights	313
	The collective dimension of the right to self-determination	314
	Self-determination and TCEs	315
5.3.3	Equality and non-discrimination	316
	The accessory character of non-discrimination	317
	Non-discrimination and indigenous peoples: land rights and cultural characteristics	318

	Equality and non-discrimination and TCEs	319
5.3.4	Freedom of expression	321
	Freedom of expression theories	321
	The enabling nature of the right to freedom of expression	325
	Indigenous peoples and freedom of expression, participation and minority rights	326
	Cultural diversity, the media and freedom of expression	328
	Freedom of expression and TCEs	334
5.3.5	Property and land	335
	The right to property, its framework character and reversed enabling nature	335
	Property, land and cultural rights	337
	Indigenous peoples and intellectual property	338
	Property and TCEs	339
5.3.6	Participation	340
	Procedural participation	341
	Participation in cultural life	349
	Participation and TCEs	353
5.3.7	Minority rights	354
	Article 27 ICCPR as a framework right and recognition of indigenous peoples	356
	Minority rights and TCEs	357
5.3.8	Cultural integrity, dignity and identity	357
	Non-discrimination, existence and cultural integrity, dignity and identity	360
	Cultural integrity and dignity and TCEs	361
5.4	TCEs and cultural and indigenous rights: objectives, principles and underlying values	362
	Recap: the normative framework of cultural and indigenous rights	363
5.4.1	Self-determination	364
5.4.2	Non-discrimination	367
5.4.3	Participation: practice, continuation and existence	370
5.4.4	Dignity	374
5.5	Conclusion: from assimilationist exclusion to inclusive principle-based protection arguments	376
Chapter 6	Beyond the existing legal tripartite: Legal and practical solutions	379
6.1	Introduction: extra-legal and practical approaches	379

TABLE OF CONTENTS

6.2	WIPO's <i>sui generis</i> efforts	380
6.2.1	The development of <i>sui generis</i> rules	381
	Fact-Finding and gaps	383
	Claims, rights and regulatory difficulties: towards a <i>sui generis</i> regime	395
6.2.2	Objectives and principles: multidimensional and cross-cutting	396
	Revised Objectives	396
	General Guiding Principles	397
	Preambular principles and objectives of the Draft Articles	398
6.2.3	Content of the specialised rules: an analysis	401
	Subject matter I: use of terms	402
	Subject matter II: protection/eligibility criteria	403
	Beneficiaries and administration of rights: communities, states, agencies	405
	Scope of protection: a distinction between 'types' of TCEs	408
	Exceptions and limitations: checks and balances	413
	Duration: an indigenous dimension	416
	Sanctions, transboundary cooperation and awareness-raising	417
6.2.4	Focus of protection: outcome rather than process	418
6.2.5	An international approach?	419
	Process	422
6.3	Grass-roots, local and practical initiatives	423
6.3.1	Purposes and place in the system	423
6.3.2	Labels	425
	Geographical indications	427
	Practical example: the Local Contexts project	428
6.3.3	Licences as illustrated by the Mukurtu and Local Contexts initiatives	430
	A closer look at the licences for documentation and recording	431
	Licences and TCE protection concerns	432
6.3.4	Protocols and codes of ethics	432
6.4	Concluding thoughts on TCE protection and legal and practical solutions	437
Chapter 7	Synthesis: What have we learned?	439
7.1	Introduction: from fragmentation to value-based convergence	439
7.1.1	The multidimensionality of indigenous protection interests	441
7.1.2	The legal framework: TCE relevance and underlying principles	442
	Copyright law and TCEs	443
	Cultural heritage law and TCEs	444

	Human rights law and TCEs	447
7.1.3	From disparate rules to principles and shared central values: a systems perspective	450
7.2	Shared central values of the existing legal framework and TCEs	451
7.2.1	Dignity and identity	454
7.2.2	Respect	456
7.2.3	Participation and democratisation of the discourse	458
	Criticisms of state-centredness	461
7.3	Shared central values, legal and practical solutions and TCEs	463
7.3.1	Connecting the shared central values and a <i>sui generis</i> approach	463
	Dignity and identity	463
	Respect	464
	Participation and democratisation of the discourse	466
	To sum up	469
7.3.2	Connecting the shared central values and (practical) solutions	471
	Dignity and identity	471
	Respect	472
	Participation and democratisation of the discourse	472
	To sum up	473
7.4	State obligations and legal interconnections	473
7.4.1	Obligations in an intellectual property and trade context	474
7.4.2	Obligations with regard to cultural heritage	477
7.4.3	Obligations and an indigenous dimension of human rights	479
7.5	Concluding thoughts on TCE protection and shared central values	480
	Operative values	481
	'Fragmentation' and inclusion	481
Chapter 8	Conclusions and recommendations	483
8.1	Introduction: closing the circle	483
8.2	Protection interests and approach: less is not more	484
8.3	TCE protection: a legal tripartite and one set of shared central values	486
8.4	State obligations and a human rights law basis: connecting the three legal domains	488
8.5	Answer to the research question	490
8.6	Recommendations: closing the circle	492
Bibliography		505