Table of Contents

Acknowledgements **xvii**

I Introduction **1**
1 Central Focus and Scope 1
2 Methodological Framework 8
2.1 Interdisciplinary Approach 8
2.2 Comparative Approach 9
2.3 Case Study Approach 12
2.4 Data Sources and Analysis 13
2.4.1 Legal sources 13
2.4.2 Policy, academic and media sources 14
2.4.3 Semi-structured interviews 15
2.4.4 Adopters' autobiographic stories 18
2.5 Ethical Considerations 19
3 Structure of the Book 20
4 Terminology 22

II Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes – A Criminological Analysis of the Illegal Adoption Market **25**
1 Introduction 25
2 The Structural Components of the Transnational Illegal Adoption Market 27
2.1 The Basic Logic of Routine Activity Theory 27
2.2 Demand Component 28
2.2.1 From a humanitarian deed to a remedy for involuntary childlessness 28
2.2.2 The role of adoption agencies 32
2.3 Supply Component 33
2.3.1 Source countries 33
2.3.2 Illegal practices to secure adoptable children 38
2.4 Social Control Component 41
2.4.1 Child laundering – connecting demand and illegal supply 41
2.4.2 Adoption agencies' representatives and cooperation partners in the sending countries 45

2.5 Criminogenic Asymmetries between Demand and Source Countries 47
2.6 Displacements Effects of Supply Reduction and 'Cycles of Abuse' 50
3 The International Legal Framework on Child Trafficking 52
4 The Prism of Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes 59
4.1 The Crime Prism 59
4.2 The Prismatic Analysis of Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes 61
4.2.1 Individual and social harm 62
4.2.2 Invisibility 65
4.2.3 Extent of victimization 69
4.2.4 Lack of public agreement on seriousness 70
4.2.5 Low probability of severe social response 75
5 Conclusion and Discussion 76

III The Rights of the Child and the 'Best Interests' Principle in Intercountry Adoption 81
1 Introduction 81
2 Positions on the Legitimacy of Intercountry Adoption 82
2.1 Abolitionists 83
2.2 Promoters 86
2.3 Regulationists 87
3 Background and Development of the UNCRC 89
4 Family and the Rights of the Child 90
4.1 The Definition of the Family 91
4.2 The Child's Right to be Cared for by His or Her Parents 93
4.3 The Primacy of the Child's Family and Parents 93
4.4 The State's Responsibility to Support the Child's Family and Parents 94
4.5 The Child's Right to Privacy and Family Life 96
4.6 Separation of the Child from His or Her Parents 97
4.7 The Child's Right to know His or Her Origin and Identity 100
5 Children Deprived of Their Family Environment 101
5.1 Alternative Child Care Solutions 101
5.2 Adoption 103
5.3 The Myth of a Global 'Orphan Crisis' 107
6 The Best Interests of the Child 113
6.1 Meaning and Historical Background of the Concept 113

6.2 Analysis of Article 3(1) UNCRC 115
6.3 The Child's Best Interests in Adoption Arrangements 118
6.4 The Vague Concept of 'The Child's Best Interests' – A Criminogenic Factor in the Intercountry Adoption System? 118
7 Conclusion and Discussion 127

IV The 1993 Hague Convention – A Trojan Horse in the Intercountry Adoption System? 131
1 Introduction 131
2 Background and Development of the Hague Convention 133
3 Provisions of the Hague Convention 137
3.1 Preamble 137
3.2 Scope of Application 137
3.3 Requirements of Intercountry Adoptions, Distribution of Responsibility 138
3.4 Central Authorities and Accredited Bodies 139
3.5 Procedural Requirements of Intercountry Adoptions 140
3.6 Recognition and Effects of Intercountry Adoptions 141
3.7 General Provisions and Final Clauses 141
4 The Standards and Principles of the Hague Convention 142
4.1 The Best Interests of the Child 143
4.2 The Subsidiarity Principle 144
4.3 Competent Authorities Principle 146
4.4 Principle of Preventing Improper (Financial) Gain 147
4.2 Standards for the Consent to Adoption 148
4.6 Principle of Co-operation and Co-responsibility 150
5 Limitations and Pitfalls of the Hague Convention 151
5.1 Private Adoptions 152
5.1.1 Private adoptions and illegal practices 152
5.1.2 The Hague Convention's compromise in Article 22(2) 156
5.1.3 The no contact rule in Article 29 158
5.1.4 The Hague Convention's regulation on private adoptions – a limitation? 160
5.2 Much Latitude for the Contracting States 162
5.3 Poor Implementation and Lacking Monitoring and Enforcing Mechanisms 164
5.4 Trust in the Sending Countries and Appearance of Legitimacy 171

6 Conclusion 176

V The German Intercountry Adoption System 179
1 Introduction 179
2 History, Development and Current Trends 183
3 The German Legal Framework of Intercountry Adoption 186
3.1 Stakeholders in the German Adoption System 187
3.2 International Adoption Placement Procedure 188
3.3 Judicial Adoption Procedure 190
3.4 Adoption Recognition and Conversion Procedure 193
3.5 The Child's Entry into Germany 195
4 Tolerance towards Private Adoptions 196
4.1 International Adoptions in Germany – Often a 'Private Affair' 196
4.2 Adopters' Motivation to Pursue a Do-It-Yourself Adoption 199
4.3 No Ban, No Negative Consequences 200
5 German Adoption Agencies Caught in a Tension between Integrity and Money 211
5.1 Accreditation and Authorization Requirements 211
5.2 Financial Strain 213
5.3 Competition among Helpers 218
6 Cooperation with the Sending Countries – A Matter of Trust 220
6.1 Foreign Partners, the Cogs in the Adoption System 220
6.2 Adoption Costs – Don't Ask, Don't Tell 220
6.3 Incentive Fees and Donations 224
6.4 Supervision of Representatives and Cooperation Partners 226
7 The Ethiopian Child Trafficking Incidents 230
7.1 Systemic Abuses in the Ethiopian Adoption System 230
7.2 The German Agency's Ideological and Financial Motivation to Place Children from Ethiopia 235
7.3 Hear No Evil, See No Evil – Techniques of Rationalization 237
8 The Role of the German Authorities in the Adoption System 243
8.1 Accrediting, Authorizing and Controlling German Adoption Agencies 243
8.2 Reviewing Individual Adoptions (Control on Micro Level) 245
8.3 Authorizing, Monitoring and Suspending Adoptions from Sending Countries (Control on Macro Level) 251
8.4 Central Adoption Offices as Adoption Placement Offices 259

9 Criminal Liability of German Actors 261
9.1 Child Trafficking (§ 236 StGB) 261
9.1.1 Adopters 264
9.1.2 Staff members of an adoption agency 265
9.2 Other Relevant Criminal Provisions 266
10 Conclusion and Discussion 267

VI The Dutch Intercountry Adoption System 273
1 Introduction 273
2 History, Developments and Current Trends 275
3 The Dutch Legal Framework of Intercountry Adoption 278
3.1 Stakeholders in the Dutch Adoption System 280
3.2 International Adoption Placement Procedure 281
3.3 Judicial Adoption Procedure 284
3.4 Adoption Recognition and Conversion Procedure 285
3.5 The Child's Entry into the Netherlands 287
4 Independent Adoptions 288
4.1 Partial Do-It-Yourself Adoptions (deelbemiddelingen) 288
4.2 Risks and Limitations of Partial Do-It-Yourself Adoptions 291
4.3 Private (Illegal) Adoptions – Prohibited but Not Properly Sanctioned 294
5 Dutch Adoption Agencies 303
5.1 Accreditation and Authorization Requirements 303
5.2 Financial Strain 305
6 Cooperation with the Sending Countries 308
6.1 Dutch Adoption Agencies' Partners and Their Tasks in the Sending Countries 308
6.2 Adoption Costs, Donations and 'Facilitation Payments' 309
6.3 Supervision of Foreign Representatives and Cooperation Partners 314
7 The Role of the Dutch Authorities in the Adoption System 318
7.1 Accrediting and Controlling Dutch Adoption Agencies 318
7.2 Reviewing and Approving Individual Adoptions (Control on Micro Level) 322
7.3 Authorizing, Monitoring and Suspending Adoptions from Sending Countries (Control on Macro Level) 325
7.4 The Dutch Ministry's Deference to China 330
7.4.1 The Chinese child trafficking incidents 330

7.4.2 Trust in the authorities of Hague sending countries 339
7.4.3 Diplomatic and other interests in intercountry adoptions 343
8 Criminal Liability of Dutch Actors 347
8.1 Adopters 347
8.2 Staff Members of an Adoption Agency 351
9 Discussion and Conclusion 352

VII Parenthood, Consumption and Narratives of Rescue and Love in Intercountry Adoption 357
1 Introduction 357
2 The Tension between Consumption and Parenthood in Intercountry Adoption 358
3 Methodology and Theoretical Background 361
4 The Desire to Achieve Parenthood 367
4.1 Involuntary Childlessness and the Powerful Wish to Have a Child 367
4.2 Saving a Child 374
4.3 Choosing the 'Right' Child 379
4.4 Paying for an Adoption 386
5 Becoming Parents 390
5.1 Finding the 'Meant-To-Be'-Child 390
5.2 Exhibiting Ownership 395
5.3 'Bringing Home My Child' 397
6 Discussion and Conclusion 402

VIII Comparative Analysis, General Conclusions, and Recommendations 407
1 Introduction 407
2 The Transnational Illegal Adoption Market 407
2.1 Demand and Supply 407
2.2 The Laundering Process 408
2.3 Criminogenic Asymmetries 410
2.4 The Dimensions of Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes 411
3 The Criminogenic Conditions in the German and Dutch Adoption Systems 413
3.1 The Principle of the Child's Best Interests 413
3.2 Private Adoptions in Germany and the Netherlands 416

3.3 Institutional Pressure of German and Dutch Adoption Agencies 418
3.4 The Flow of Money into the Sending Countries 421
3.5 The Monitoring and Control System in Germany and the Netherlands 423
3.6 Trust in the Hague Sending Countries 427
3.7 Adopters' Denying the Role of Money in Intercountry Adoptions 430
4 Recommendations 431
4.1 Banning Intercountry Adoptions? 431
4.2 Intercountry Adoptions carried out by the State? 432
4.3 Accountability of Adoption Agencies 434
4.4 Regulating the Flow of Money into the Sending Countries 436
4.5 Strengthening the Role of the German and the Dutch Central Authority 437
4.6 Designating the German and Dutch Immigration Authorities as Gatekeepers 439
4.7 Criminalizing the Purchase of Children for Adoption 439
4.8 Reconsidering the Way We Think about Intercountry Adoption 441

References **443**